

# The Effect of Herringbone Technique on the Students' Ability in Comprehending Reading of Narrative Text

Asima Rohana Sinaga<sup>1\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> English Education Department, Universitas HKBP Nommensen Pematangsiantar, Indonesia

## Email Address

asima.r.sinaga@gmail.com (Asima Rohana Sinaga)

\*Correspondence: asima.r.sinaga@gmail.com

**Received:** 1 November 2020; **Accepted:** 15 December 2020; **Published:** 20 December 2020

---

## Abstract:

This research was conducted to find out the effect of Herringbone Technique on the students' ability in comprehending reading narrative text at grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar. The problem of the research is "Does Herringbone Technique significantly affects on the students' ability in comprehending reading Narrative text at grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar?" The methodology which used in this research was the quantitative research. The data for this research was collected from the grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar. The writer used two classes as the sample, where one class was experimental group and the other one as the control group. The instrument for collecting data was by reading test. The text used is narrative text. The questions are arranged in such a way to ask all components of the narrative text. The data were analyzed by applying the T-test. It was found that the T- observed was 5.3 and T-table was 2.00 at the level of significant  $p=0.05$  and  $df=78$ ; ( $N_x + N_y - 2 = 40 + 40 - 2 = 78$ ). The result of the analysis shows that the value of the T-observed was higher than the value T-table ( $5.3 > 2.00$ ). It means that Herringbone Technique has significant affect on the students' ability in comprehending Narrative text, and the suggestion is the teacher should use Herringbone Technique in teaching English especially in teaching reading to improve the students' reading comprehension competence.

## Keywords:

Herringbone, Reading, Narrative, Technique

---

## 1. Introduction

Reading is an essential skill for the students, because reading activities is dominant in classroom. "Reading is a language process requiring the understanding of written language" [2]. Reading text also provides opportunities to study language: vocabulary, grammar, punctuation, and the way we construct sentences, paragraphs, and texts. Hence, Meng as cited in Herman, Sibarani and Pardede [8] stated that English reading has always been regarded as one of the main aims in English teaching in colleges and

universities, because it can objectively reflect the students' abilities to acquire the language. In short, comprehending a reading text is really important for English learners.

Reading text also provides opportunities to study language: vocabulary, grammar, punctuation, and the way we construct sentences, paragraphs, and texts. Reading involves both the acquisition of meanings intended by the writer and the reader's own contributions in the form of interpretation, evaluation, and reflection on those meaning. Sometimes the students think that reading English is not interesting and boring since they do not know the meaning of the words and do not find an interesting book. The students need many kinds of interesting materials so that they feel happy and motivated to learn English. Therefore, the existence of the teaching method is important. Based on syllabus in at junior high school, the students are demanded to understand and to get meaning from each text that have been read. The purpose of teaching reading is to improve students' skill in comprehending the text and getting important information contained in the text. On other hand, many students have difficulties in comprehend the text. Most of them only read without knowing what they read. For instance, the teacher gives a text to students, and then asks them to read it in order to build their comprehension and show the inference of what they have read. Based on the researcher's observation, researcher was found that students have problems in learning English lesson especially in reading skill. The reasons are they still have difficulties in getting the idea and understanding the text, finding general information and specific information in the passage, difficult to identify explicit and implicit information, and to find reference and limited vocabulary especially in reading narrative texts.

The researcher got data that showed how the ability of the student in reading especially in narrative text, among 30 students, the researcher found that the student who got mark  $\geq 70$  were only 9 students, 29 students got less than  $\leq 70$ . The data show that the students don't know about narrative text yet. The mean of data is 50. This data concluded that comprehending a reading text is still a big problem for students, while mastering a reading comprehension is a must for every student. Sinaga, Herman and Siahaan [16] and Lumbantobing, et al [12] stated that reading comprehension is a good way to develop and to derive meaning from written language (including books and other forms of written language) and constructing meaning from written language.

In order to produce good reading ability, students need to use appropriate method or strategy in learning reading skill that is why the researcher is interested in investigating and applying one of the teaching English especially in reading strategies which is named Herringbone strategy.

"The Herringbone Technique develops comprehension of the main idea by plotting who, what, when, where, how, and why questions on a visual diagram of a fish skeleton. Using the answers to the WH questions, the student writes the main idea across the backbone of the fish diagram" [5].

Herringbone Technique is graphic organizers which represent visual information and concepts in teaching learning process. McKnight [13] states that "Herringbone Technique is used for establishing supporting details for a main idea". In addition, Herringbone Technique helps students understand the connections between supporting details to identify a main idea. For the idea surrounding the problem of the research is "The Effect of Herringbone Technique on the students' ability in

comprehending reading Narrative text at grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar”.

## **2. Theoretical Review**

### **2.1. Reading**

Reading skill is important in language skills. Every students must study and become master on it. Reading is a basic tool of learning. Reading is an accurate tool in promoting life-long learning. Reading in language learning plays an important role. In English language learning, mainly in secondary school, reading is one of the four language skills. Students have to learn it. The aim of the English learning is to develop English communicative competence, which involves listening, speaking, reading, and writing in their appropriate balance.

### **2.2. Types of Reading**

According to Patel & Jain [15], there are four types of reading, such as:

#### **2.2.1. Intensive Reading**

Intensive reading is related to further progress in language learning under the teacher's guidance. The goal of this reading is to read shorter text. This reading is done to carry out to get specific information. Intensive reading will provide a basis for explaining difficulties of structure and for extending knowledge of vocabulary and idioms. It will also provide material for developing greater control of the language in speech and writing.

#### **2.2.2. Extensive Reading**

Extensive reading can be made the basis for oral reports, to the rest of the class, or full class discussion. It may be the source for written compositions in which students deal with specific issues arising from the material in the book. Extensive reading is the reading for pleasure. The reader wants to know about something. The reader does not care about specific or important information after reading.

#### **2.2.3. Reading Aloud**

Reading aloud also play important role in teaching of English. Teacher should know that the training of reading aloud must be given at primary level because it is the base of words pronunciation. If it is not cared, it will be very difficult at secondary level.

#### **2.2.4. Silent reading**

This reading should be employed to increase reading ability among learners. Silent reading is done to acquire a lot of information. Teacher has to make them read silently as and when they are able to read without any difficulties. It is kind of habit in which learner are enabled to read without any audible whisper.

### **2.3. Levels of Reading Comprehension**

According to Dorn and Soffos [6], Levels of Reading Comprehension are :

#### **2.3.1. Surface Level**

The Surface level of comprehension is a literal level of understanding represented by the ability to recall factual information from the text. This retrieval process involves short-term memory; thus this level of understanding directly relates to the regency of the reading. The desire to think beyond the surface level requires motivation. A reader might possess the strategies to think deeper.

### ***2.3.2. Deep Level***

The deep level of comprehension is a conceptual of understanding that result from the reader's ability to think beyond the text, thus integrating the author's intentions with the reader's point of view. At this level, the author's message serves as a pivotal point in regulating the reader's deep thinking. The text becomes reconstructed or tailored in the readers' mind to accommodate the reader's background experience and personal goals. Deep comprehension is the result of the mind's analyzing and synthesizing multiple sources of information, thus lifting a reader's comprehension to new levels of meaning. Discussing a book with others has significant influence on depth comprehension.

### ***2.4. Narrative***

Narrative is a kind of enjoyable text to read. Keir [10] defines narrative as "The representation of an event or a series of events". Something has to happen; description and counting are not narrative. Nor is the real story, which happens over a length of time, and has an order of events, the narrative: narrative plays with that and is malleable. We as writers think with narrative, and negotiate or contest the story. narrative is a basic and constant form of human expression regardless of ethnic origin, primary language, and enculturation.

### ***2.5. Herringbone Technique***

The Herringbone Technique develops comprehension of the main idea by plotting the who, what, when, where, how, and why questions on a visual diagram of a fish skeleton. Using the answers to the WH questions, the student writes the main idea across the backbone of the fish diagram [5]. Hence, Herringbone is a kind of technique used in reading process for establishing supporting details for main idea McKnight [13] as cited in Lumbantobing, Pardede and Herman, [8]. Beside that, herringbone technique also to help students summarize and synthesize what they have read; to provide a supportive framework for students to sort through the information provided in narrative text and make their own decisions about what is important; to help students think about the main idea, significant details, and the relationships among them.

Herringbone Technique is a technique in which the students work in pairs or triads. The teacher poses a narrative text and the students read that narrative text. After reading, the groups complete the Herringbone diagram by discussing the text, considering possible answers to the questions on the Herringbone, and deciding cooperatively upon the answer that seems best to them. When the groups have completed their tasks, the teacher assembles the entire class so that the groups can share their decisions and the reasons for them, with each other.

### ***2.6. Procedures of Herringbone Technique***

The procedures of herringbone technique are:

- a. The teacher selects a text at the appropriate reading level.
- b. The teacher constructs a visual diagram of the herringbone.
- c. The teacher tells the student to record the answers to the questions on the diagram.
- d. He will look for answers to: Who is the author talking about? What did they do? When did they do it? Where did they do it? How did they do it? Why did they do it?
- e. The student reads to find the answers and records the answers on the diagram.
- a. After the information is recorded, the teacher shows the student how each answer fits into a slot in a main idea sentence.
- f. The student writes a main idea, using the information from the herringbone diagram.
- g. The teacher duplicates sheets with the diagram, and students complete diagram on their own. The diagram becomes a tool for story discussion. During the discussion, the teacher and students compare their answers and their rationales.

### ***2.7. The Advantages and the Disadvantages of Herringbone Technique***

An advantage of the Herringbone Technique is to help the students for encoding the information in a manner that enhances their ability to answer questions, Herringbone Technique also helps the students spend a few times while they are reading the text. So, the students will not get bored when they read narrative text.

While the disadvantage of Herringbone is when students learn material with the help of graphic representations, note-taking will be decreased. As a result, the lack of a comprehensive guide those students can refer to when revising material may affect their performance.

## **3. Methodology of the Research**

### ***3.1. Design of Research***

This research follows the methodology in description quantitative approach. According to Creswell [4] as cited in Ivantara, Herman and Manalu [9], a quantitative research is a mean for testing objective theories by examining the relationship among variables. This research method is used to describe variables, to examine relationships among variables and to determine cause-and-effect interactions between variables (Burns & Grove, as cited in Herman, Sibarani and Pardede [8]). This research follows the methodology in description quantitative approach. It is descriptive because the writer wants to find out the effect of Herringbone technique on the students' ability in comprehending narrative text at grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar. The researcher used an experimental research. In this study, the researcher divided the sample into two classes, namely experimental class and control class. The experimental group that receives treatment by using Herringbone Technique. The other one is the control group without using Herringbone Technique.

***Table 1. Design of Research.***

Group	Pre – Test	Treatment	Post-Test
Experimental	X	√	X2
Control	Y	–	Y2

*Note: Treatment using Herringbone's Technique*

: *Treatment without Herringbone's Technique*

### 3.2. Population and Sample

According to Creswell [4] as cited in Sirait, Hutauruk and Herman [17], population is a group of individuals who have the same characteristic. The population of this research is the second year of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar. There are three classes ( VIII-1 Up to VIII-3) and the total number of student is 120 students. In this research, the writer used purposive random sampling technique. The control group was the group which is used a different treatment or non herringbone technique and experimental group was the group which is used received treatment by using herringbone technique. So the writer took randomly to be researched where experimental group consists of 40 students, and control group consists of 40 students and the total of the student are 80.

### 3.3. Instrument of Collecting Data

According to Arikunto [1], research instrument is a kind of tool which is used by the researcher to collect or to get the data. Instrument that is used in this research for collecting data is multiple choices that consist of 20 items and each item consists of 4 options. The text used is narrative text. the questions are arranged in such a way to ask all components of the narrative text. Test is a set of questions and exercises used to measure the achievement or capacity of the individual or group. The test will be conducted to both control class and experimental class which consist of 40 students of control class and 40 students of experiment class before and after the treatment. Test specification is a specification of which test suites and test cases to run and which to skip. Test specification contains information of the test question. In question, there are material question, the level of competence, and overall test.

Based on the explanation above, the writer make test specification from the scope of study about narrative text. The categories that are used in this question just knowledge and comprehension.

### 3.4. Scoring of the Reading Test

In doing the scoring of reading ability test of the experimental group and control group, the writer processed the result of the students' test.

*Table 2. Scoring Test.*

Score	Category
80 – 100	Excellent
66 – 79	Good
56 – 65	Fair
41 – 55	Poor
0 – 40	Very Poor

(Arikunto, 2006: 245)

### 3.5. The Technique for Analyzing Data

There are two groups of data, those of experimental group and control group. According to Arikunto [1] To analyze the data, the researcher uses the T-Test Formula.

$$t = \frac{M_x - M_y}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{x^2 + y^2}{N_x + N_y - 2}\right) \left(\frac{1}{N_x} + \frac{1}{N_y}\right)}}$$

Where:

T = Treatment

$M_x$  = Mean of experimental group

$M_y$  = Mean of control group

X = Standard deviation of experimental group

Y = Standard deviation of control group

$N_x$  = Total number samples of experimental group

$N_y$  = Total number of control group

#### 4. Research Finding

Based on analyzed data, the researcher found that T-observed is higher than T-table ( $5.3 > 2.00$ ) at the level of significant is 0.05 with  $df = 78$  ( $N_x + N_y - 2 = 40 + 40 - 2$ ). It means that the test is significant, So Herringbone Technique significantly effects on the students' ability in comprehending reading Narrative text at grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar with the mean of experimental in pre-test is 67 and the mean of experimental in post-test is 82.875. Beside that The validity of experimental group is 0.65 and The reliability of experimental group is 0.78.

This results of this research showed that there is a similarity with the previous research done by Lumbantobing et al [12] entitled The Effect of Herringbone Technique on the Students' Ability in Reading Comprehension on Recount Text. Both articles used a quantitative research design. The technique was also the same, it was herringbone. While, the difference was lied on the text being used. This research used narrative text, while research by Lumbantobing et al [12] used recount text. These two research papers showed that herringbone technique is really good for helping students to improve their reading comprehension skills.

#### 5. Conclusions

Based on the result of the data analysis, which has been stated in chapter IV, so the writer concluded that The herringbone technique as formed at the grade VIII of SMP Swasta GKPS 3 Pematangsiantar had significant affects on the students' ability in comprehending reading Narrative text. The result of T-test had proved the significance difference means of experimental group and control group. The result of T-test = 5.3 while T-table 2.00 at  $df = 78$  ( $N_x + N_y - 2 = 40 + 40 - 2$ ) and the level of significant  $p = 0.05$ . The mean score of experimental group in post test was 82.875 and the mean score of control group in post test was 56. It meant that the experimental group was better than the control group.

#### Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest regarding the publication of this article.

## Funding

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

## References

- [1] Arikunto, S. *Prosedur penelitian: Suatu pendekatan praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta. 2013.
- [2] Arthur, H.W. *Practices Teaching Reading*. New York: Merrill Publishing Co. Inc. 2005.
- [3] Barus, L.D.G.; Herman.; Niswa, K. The Effect of Student Teams Achievement Divisions (STAD) to the Students' Writing Ability on Recount Text. *Journal of English Education and Teaching (JEET)*, 2020, 4(4), 536-547.
- [4] Creswell, J. W. (2011). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA Sage.
- [5] Deegan, J. Herringbone Technique. Available online: <http://www.teacherweb.com/PA/NazarethAreaMiddleSchool/TheSpecialistTeam/HerringboneTechnique.doc> (accessed on 14 March 2013).
- [6] Dorn, L.; Soffos, C. *Teaching for Deep Comprehension*. USA: Stenhouse Publisher. 2005.
- [7] Harmer, Jeremy. *The Practice of English Language Teaching* Longman Handbooks for Language Teacher, London: Longman Ninth Impression, 2001.
- [8] Herman.; Sibarani, J. K.; Pardede, H. The Effect of Jigsaw Technique in Reading Comprehension on Recount Text. *Cetta: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan, Jayapangus Press*, 2020, 3(1), 84-102.
- [9] Ivantara, E.P.; Herman.; Manalu, D.B. The Effect of Using Cooperative Script on Student's Reading Comprehension at Grade Elevent of SMA Negri 2 Pematangsiantar. *Acitya: Journal of Teaching & Education*, 2020, 2(2), 82-94.
- [10] Keir. *Imaginative Narratives: Perfecting the Art of Writing Stories*. Greenwood: Ready-Ed Publications. 2009.
- [11] Linse T. Caroline. *Practical English Language Teaching Young Learners*. North America: McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. 2005.
- [12] Lumbatobing, S.R.A.H.; Pardede, H.; Herman. The Effect of Herringbone Technique on the Students' Ability in Reading Comprehension on Recount Text. *Journal of English Educational Study*, 2020, 3(2), 1-10.
- [13] McKnight, Katherine S. *The Teacher's Big Book of Graphic Organizers: 100 Reproducible Organizers that Help Kids with Reading, Writing, and the Content Areas*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. 2010.
- [14] Nunan, David. *Research Method in Language Learning*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
- [15] Patel, M.F.; Jain M. Praveen. *English Language Teaching*. Sunrise Publishers & Distributors. 2008.

- [16] Sinaga, Y.K.; Herman.; Siahaan, P.L. The Effect of Partner Reading Strategy on Reading Comprehension. *Journal of English Education and Teaching (JEET)*, 2020, 4(2), 206-218.
- [17] Sirait, M.F.; Hutauruk, B.S.; Herman. The Effect of Using Speed Reading Technique to the Students' Ability in Comprehending a Text. *Cetta: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 2020, 3(3), 485-498.



© 2021 by the author(s); licensee International Technology and Science Publications (ITS), this work for open access publication is under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY 4.0). (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)